



Birch Horton Bittner & Cherot

a professional corporation

Memorandum 16-031

**TO: KATIE KOESTER
CITY MANAGER, CITY OF HOMER**

FROM: THOMAS F. KLINKNER

RE: REGULATION OF MOTORIZED VEHICLES ON BEACHES

FILE NO.: 506,742.1003

DATE: AUGUST 26, 2015

This memorandum supplements and replaces my memorandum of August 18, 2015, on this subject, providing supporting citations and a more detailed analysis of the relationship between City regulation of motorized vehicle use in beach areas and state regulation of activities in beach areas within the Kachemak Bay Critical Habitat Area ("KBCHA"). I begin by discussing what constitutes the "beach area" under the current Homer City Code and proposed Ordinance 15-29, the geographic terms conventionally used to categorize the components of the "beach area," and how those terms are related to property boundaries in the "beach area." I then describe state regulation of motorized vehicle use in the KBCHA, and compare it to the regulation of motorized vehicle use under proposed Ordinance 15-29.

What is the "Beach Area"? Both current HCC 19.16.020 and proposed Ordinance 15-29 define the term "beach area" to include "the zone of sand, gravel and other unconsolidated materials that extends landward from the low water line to the place where there is a marked change in material or physiographic form." This definition differs from the usual categorization of areas along a shoreline: (i) the area below the elevation of mean low water, referred to as "submerged lands"; (ii) the area between the elevations of mean low water and mean high water, referred to as "tidelands"; and (iii) the area above the elevation of mean high water, referred to as "uplands".¹ The "beach area" as defined in HCC 19.16.020 and proposed Ordinance 15-29 begins at the elevation of mean low water—the boundary between submerged lands and tidelands—and extends landward to a "place where this is a marked change in material or physiographic form"—the bottom of road and other embankments on the Spit, and the toe of the bluff at most other locations—which includes uplands above the elevation of mean high water as well as tidelands.

¹ *City of Saint Paul v. State, Dept. of Natural Resources*, 137 P.3d 261, 262 (Alaska 2006).

Property Ownership in the "Beach Area." Subject to the exception discussed below, the City owns the tidelands within the beach area,² while most of the uplands within the beach area are privately owned.³ In most cases, the boundary between tideland and upland property is "ambulatory," moving seaward or landward with the erosion or accretion of material on the beach that determines the current mean high water line.⁴ The exception to this general rule occurs when the mean high water line changes as the result of a sudden subsidence or uplifting of the beach area caused by an event such as an earthquake. In such a case, the boundary of property ownership continues to be located at the mean high water line that existed before the sudden subsidence or uplifting event.⁵ This exception may affect property boundaries in beach areas in the City that experienced sudden subsidence during the 1964 earthquake. Where such subsidence occurred, the boundary of an upland parcel may extend seaward of the current mean high water line, resulting in private ownership of some beach areas that presently are tidelands. Determining the precise boundary of property ownership in such cases would require a detailed investigation of changes in the beach area topography at and after events such as the 1964 earthquake.

Regulation of Motorized Vehicle Use in the KBCHA. The KBCHA initially included all beach areas within the City that are below mean high water.⁶ In 2014, the legislature excluded certain areas on the north side of the Spit in and around the Homer Harbor from the KBCHA.⁷ This was done to accommodate the long-term docking of a jack-up rig at the Deep Water Dock, which it was believed otherwise would conflict with the regulations governing the KBCHA.⁸

Two regulations govern activities in the KBCHA. One regulation, 5 AAC 95.610, adopts by reference the goals and policies of the Kachemak Bay and Fox River Flats Critical Habitat Areas Management Plan (the "Plan"). Although the Plan provides that off-road use of motorized vehicles generally is not permitted in the KBCHA, the Plan states that it does not apply to City of Homer lands.⁹ Thus, the Plan's provisions regarding off-road use of motorized vehicles do not apply to beach areas in the City.

² Before Alaska statehood, the federal government owned all of the tide and submerged lands in Alaska. Upon Alaska's admission as a state, the Alaska Statehood Act transferred tide and submerged lands to the State of Alaska. *City of St. Paul*, 137 P.3d at 262 n. 1. The state later transferred to the City the tide and submerged lands located within the City limits.

³ Upland parcels owned by the City are identified in the City's Land Allocation Plan.

⁴ *DeBoer v. United States*, 653 F.2d 1313, 1314-1315 (9th Cir. 1981).

⁵ *Honsinger v. State*, 642 P.2d 1352, 1354 (Alaska 1982).

⁶ AS 16.20.590(a).

⁷ Ch. 3 SLA 2014, enacting AS 16.20.590(b).

⁸ 5 AAC 95.420(a)(5) requires a special area permit for "natural resource or energy exploration, development, production or associated activities" in the KBCHA.

⁹ "The plan does not apply to federal or municipal lands within the critical habitat areas." Plan, p. 1. "Both state land and private land are included in the critical habitat areas but

The other regulation, 5 AAC 95.420, requires a special permit from the Commissioner of Fish and Game to engage in certain activities in the KBCHA. Among those restricted activities is "off-road use of wheeled or tracked equipment unless the commissioner has issued a general permit under 5 AAC 95.770."¹⁰ The restrictions in 5 AAC 95.420 are not subject to an exception for City of Homer lands, and therefore apply within the beach areas in the City that lie within the KBCHA. However, the Commissioner of Fish and Game has invoked the exception in 5 AAC 95.420(a)(7) by issuing a general permit under 5 AAC 95.770 that permits the off-road use in the KBCHA of vehicles of 10,000 pounds or less gross vehicle weight on unvegetated tidelands below mean high tide in motorized vehicle corridors that extend westward from Bidarki Creek and eastward from Miller's Landing, to provide "normal personal and recreational transit."¹¹

Comparing Proposed Ordinance 15-29 to the KBCHA Regulations. Proposed Ordinance 15-29 would permit motorized vehicle use in beach areas (i) on the southern side of the Spit from October 1 through March 31, and (ii) by owners of property immediately adjacent to a beach area as reasonably necessary to maintain the owner's property, in accordance with the terms of a permit issued for that purpose by the chief of police. There are three distinct parts to the relationship between the permission of motorized vehicle use under proposed Ordinance 15-29 and the state's regulation of motorized vehicle use in the KBCHA:

- To the extent that Ordinance 15-29 permits motorized vehicle use in beach areas above the mean high water line, it does not conflict with the state's regulation of motorized vehicle use in the KBCHA, as beach areas above the mean high water line lie outside the KBCHA.
- To the extent that proposed Ordinance 15-29 permits motorized vehicle use in beach areas below the mean water line, it does not conflict with the Plan as incorporated in 5 AAC 95.610, because the Plan does not apply to City of Homer lands.
- The permission of motorized vehicle use in beach areas below the mean water line in proposed Ordinance 15-29 does conflict with 5 AAC 95.420(a)(7), which prohibits such use except under the general permit for motorized vehicle use in the areas west of Bidarki Creek and east of Miller's Landing.

TFK/lcj

municipal (City of Homer and City of Seldovia tidelands) and federal lands are not under critical habitat area authority." Plan, p. A-1.

¹⁰ 5 AAC 95.420(a)(7).

¹¹ Special Area Permit 15-V-0005-GP-SA, issued December 16, 2014.